#### BEFORE THE UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION

DESERET GENERATION AND TRANSMISSION COOPERATIVE,

Petitioner,

CARBON COUNTY, DAGGETT COUNTY, DUCHESNE COUNTY, EMERY COUNTY, MILLARD COUNTY, SALT LAKE COUNTY, UINTAH COUNTY AND UTAH COUNTY,

Cross-Petitioners.

VS.

PROPERTY TAX DIVISION OF THE UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION,

Respondent.

#### ORDER OF APPROVAL

Appeal No.

19-1592

Account No: 12572089-101-PCA

Tax Type:

Property Tax/Centrally Assessed

Tax Year:

2019

Judge:

Marshall

#### STATEMENT OF THE CASE

This matter came before the Utah State Tax Commission on Petitioner's and Cross-Petitioners' appeal of the property tax assessment on the subject property. Petitioner, Cross-Petitioners' and Respondent have agreed that an adjustment to Respondent's initial valuation from \$335,687,720 to \$235,894,197 for the 2019 tax year is necessary.

Each affected county had standing to object to the assessment of the subject property pursuant to Utah Code Ann. §59-2-1007, but elected not to do so.

#### **ORDER**

Based on the foregoing, the Utah State Tax Commission hereby finds the market value of the subject property for the tax year 2019 is \$235,894,197.

The Property Tax Division has calculated final adjustments to the values apportioned to each affected tax district resulting from this order. The attached copy of that information is made part of this order by this reference. County officials are to use the information provided to adjust their tax rolls in

#### Appeal No. 19-1592

accordance with the revised assessment and to calculate refunds as appropriate.

Jan Marshall Administrative Law Judge

BY ORDER OF THE COMMISSION:

25

**February** 

DATED this \_\_\_\_

\_\_\_day of \_\_

, 2022.

Tohn L. Valentine Commission Chair

EXCUSED

Rebecca L. Rockwell Commissioner SEAL

Michael J. Cragun

Commissioner

Jehnifer N. Fresques Commissioner

**NOTICE:** An order approving a stipulated agreement constitutes final agency action subject to judicial review pursuant to Utah Code Ann. §§59-1-601 and 63-46b-13 et.seq. Any action to enforce the agreement may be brought pursuant to Utah Code Ann. §63-46b-19.

Attorneys for Property Tax Division of the Utah State Tax Commission

### BEFORE THE UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION

## DESERET GENERATION & TRANSMISSION COOPERATIVE,

joshuanelson@agutah.gov

Petitioner,

vs.

# PROPERTY TAX DIVISION OF THE UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION,

Respondent,

#### APPEARING COUNTIES,

Affected Parties in Interest.

### STIPULATION FOR SETTLEMENT AND DISMISSAL OF PETITIONS AND CROSS-PETITIONS

Appeal No. 19-1592

Account No. 12572089-101-PCA

Tax Type: Centrally Assessed

#### STIPULATION AND SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

The parties in the above-captioned appeal, Deseret Generation & Transmission Cooperative ("DG&T"), Carbon County, Daggett County, Duchesne County, Emery County, Millard County, Salt Lake County, Uintah County, and Utah County (the "Appearing Counties") and the Property Tax Division of the Utah State Tax Commission (the "Division") for property tax year 2019, by and through their respective representatives, hereby stipulate to a resolution and settlement of the above-captioned appeal as follows:

- 1. This Stipulation and Settlement Agreement concerns DG&T's 2019 property tax appeals and the Appearing Counties' cross-appeals for that year.
- 2. The parties have discussed and considered their respective positions concerning the assessed values determined by the Division for property tax year 2019 and recognize the considerable costs and risks inherent in the potential litigation of these matters.
- 3. The parties mutually desire to avoid these costs and risks and fully settle and resolve DG&T's appeal and the Appearing Counties' cross-appeals for the 2019 property tax year, without further litigation, in a fair, reasonable and economic fashion.
- 4. DG&T owns and operates the Bonanza Power Plant Unit 1 in Uintah County, Utah ("Bonanza").
- 5. DG&T represents that, according to a settlement agreement it entered into with Region 8 of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and others, Bonanza's coal consumption

has been limited to 20 million short tons (the "Cap"). DG&T forecasts that it will reach the Cap in 2032.

- 6. DG&T represents that it has agreed to close Bonanza when it reaches the Cap and has no plans to extend the life of Bonanza or avoid the Cap.
- 7. Based on DG&T's representations, the parties stipulate that DG&T's 2019 valuation should be reduced from \$335,687,720 to \$235,894,197. The impact of the proposed change to the assessed value is set forth in the County Breakout Report for 2020 attached as Exhibit "A".
- 8. The parties further stipulate that the stipulated value amount falls within the parties' opinion of a reasonable range of fair market value based on DG&T's representations.
- 9. The impacted counties shall pay refund amounts required by the change in assessed values set forth in Exhibit "A" without any associated interest that may be due, which DG&T hereby agrees to waive. Refunds shall be paid in ordinary course, but in no event no later than 31 December 2022. For Uintah County, this represents a change in valuation of \$52,856,804 and a refund of \$645,643.
- 10. DG&T agrees and stipulates that it will provide timely notice to the Appearing Counties and the Division if it changes its plan to close Bonanza when it reaches the agreed Cap.
- 11. In the event DG&T does not close Bonanza after reaching the Cap and it is shown that DG&T misrepresented its intentions as set forth in this Stipulation and Settlement Agreement,

in addition to constituting a breach of this Stipulation and Settlement Agreement, it shall also constitute "incomplete or erroneous information furnished by the taxpayer" under Utah Code section 59-2-102(12)(a)(iii), defining "escaped property," and the Division and the Counties shall not be limited by Utah Code section 59-2-217(1) in how far back they may assess it.

- 12. The parties hereby stipulate that their respective appeal and cross-appeals for 2019 are hereby withdrawn, and they jointly request the Utah State Tax Commission to enter an order of dismissal. The parties agree that they will each be responsible for their own legal expenses, including attorneys' fees, related to these appeals.
- 13. The parties understand that this Stipulation and Settlement Agreement is subject to approval by the Utah State Tax Commission and its subsequent issuance of a written order of dismissal of the appeal and cross-appeals for 2019 as represented by an Order of Dismissal for Appeal No. 19-1592.
- 14. The signatories to this Stipulation and Settlement Agreement acknowledge that they are authorized to sign and enter this Stipulation and Settlement Agreement on behalf of the parties they represent.
- 15. The parties further stipulate and agree that this Stipulation and Settlement Agreement is and may be treated as a public record.
- 16. Should the Utah State Tax Commission decline to approve this Stipulation and Settlement Agreement, it shall be null and void and shall not be admissible as evidence against any

party in any future proceedings.

17. This Stipulation and Settlement Agreement shall be binding on the parties and shall constitute full resolution of DG&T's appeal and the Appearing Counties' cross-appeals for 2019.

#### STIPULATED this 12th day of January 2022 by:

## DESERET GENERATION & TRANSMISSION COOPERATIVE

#### PROPERTY TAX DIVISION

/s/David Detton\*
David Detton
Detton Law
Attorney for Taxpayer Deserte Generation &
Transmission Cooperative
\*Signal by files year outlestingtion via amail on 12

\*Signed by filer upon authorization via email on 12 January 2022.

/s/Barton H. Kunz II

/s/Laron Lind\*
Laron Lind
John McCarrey
Joshua Nelson
Assistant Utah Attorneys General
Attorneys for the Property Tax Division
\*Signed by filer upon authorization via email on 12
January 2022.
/s/Barton H. Kunz II

## CARBON COUNTY, DAGGETT COUNTY, EMERY COUNTY, MILLARD COUNTY

DUCHESNE COUNTY

/s/Thomas W. Peters\*
Thomas W. Peters
Peters Scofield PC

Attorneys for Appearing Counties Carbon County, Daggett County, Emery County, and Millard County

\*Signed by filer upon authorization via email on 12 January 2022.

/s/Barton H. Kunz II

/s/Tyler Allred\*
Tyler Allred
Deputy Duchesne County Attorney
Attorneys for Appearing County Duchesne
County
\*Signed by filer upon authorization via email on 12

\*Signed by filer upon authorization via email on 12 January 2022.
/s/Barton H. Kunz II

SALT LAKE COUNTY

/s/Tim Bodily\*
Tim Bodily

**UINTAH COUNTY** 

/s/Barton H. Kunz II Barton H. Kunz II

### Deputy Salt Lake County District Attorney Attorneys for Appearing County Salt Lake County

\*Signed by filer upon authorization via email on 12 January 2022. /s/Barton H. Kunz II

## County

Attorneys for Appearing County Uintah

Goebel Anderson PC

#### **UTAH COUNTY**

/s/Paul Jones\*
Paul Jones
Deputy Utah County Attorney
Attorneys for Appearing County Utah County
\*Signed by filer upon authorization via email on 12

January 2022. /s/Barton H. Kunz II

## EXHIBIT A

### COUNTY BREAKOUT REPORT



## Utah State Tax Commission Property Tax Division - Centrally Assessed

#### 2019 Revised Notice of Valuation County Breakout Report

Taxpayer: DESERET GENERATION & TRANS COOP

Taxpayer Number: 12572089-010-PCA

Appeal Number: 19-1592 & 19-1592 Industry: Electric Utility

County	Tax Area	Original Valuation	Revised Valuation	Change in Valuation
Carbon				
	009-0000	\$334,888	\$235,333	-\$99,555
Carbon County Total		\$334,888	\$235,333	-\$99,555
Daggett				
	001-0000	\$60,948	\$42,829	-\$18,119
Daggett County Total		\$60,948	\$42,829	-\$18,119
Duchesne				
	021-0000	\$21,387	\$15,029	-\$6,358
	091-0000	\$15,689,789	\$11,025,515	-\$4,664,274
Duchesne County Total		<i>\$15,711,176</i>	\$11,040,544	-\$4,670,632
Emery				
	020-0000	\$80,020,804	\$56,232,154	-\$23,788,650
Emery County Total		\$80,020,804	\$56,232,154	-\$23,788,65 <b>0</b>
Iron				
	007-0000	\$76,926	\$54,057	-\$22,869
Iron County Total		\$76,926	<i>\$54,057</i>	-\$22,869
Juab				
	005-0000	\$12,044,829	\$8,464,132	-\$3,580,697
Juab County Total		\$12,044,829	\$8,464,132	-\$3,580,697
Kane				
	002-0000	\$147,928	\$103,952	-\$43,976
Kane County Total		\$147,928	\$103,952	-\$43,976
Millard				
	006-0000	\$66,623	\$46,817	-\$19,806
Millard County Total		\$66,623	\$46,817	-\$19,806
Salt Lake				
	39G-0000	\$5,774,211	\$4,057,649	-\$1,716,562
Salt Lake County Total		\$5,774,211	\$4,057,649	-\$1,716,562
Sanpete				
	015-0000	\$4,612,858	\$3,241,544	-\$1,371,314



## Utah State Tax Commission Property Tax Division - Centrally Assessed

### 2019 Revised Notice of Valuation County Breakout Report

Taxpayer: DESERET GENERATION & TRANS COOP

Taxpayer Number: 12572089-010-PCA

Appeal Number: 19-1592 & 19-1592 Industry: Electric Utility

County	Tax Area	<b>Original Valuation</b>	<b>Revised Valuation</b>	Change in Valuation
Sanpete County Total		\$4,612,858	\$3,241,544	-\$1,371,314
Sevier				
	012-0000	\$26,172	\$18,392	-\$7,780
Sevier County Total		\$26,172	\$18,392	-\$7,780
Uintah				
	001-0000	\$175,310,394	\$123,193,974	-\$52,116,420
	002-0000	\$2,042,642	\$1,435,404	-\$607,238
	005-0000	\$447,880	\$314,734	-\$133,146
Uintah County Total		\$177,800,916	\$124,944,112	-\$52,856,804
Utah				
	125-0000	\$25,928,021	\$18,220,117	-\$7,707,904
Utah County Total		\$25,928,02 <b>1</b>	\$18,220,117	-\$7,707,904
Wasatch				
	012-0003	\$12,811,372	\$9,002,797	-\$3,808,575
Wasatch County Total		\$12,811,372	\$9,002,797	-\$3,808,575
Washington				
	000-800	\$270,048	\$189,768	-\$80,280
Washington County Total		\$270,048	\$189,768	-\$80,280
TOTAL VALUE		\$335,687,720	\$235,894,197	-\$99,793,523

## USTC – Appeal Certificate of Mailing

Utah State Tax Commission

Descret Generation and Transmission Cooperative (Petitioner) vs Property Tax Division (Respondent) 19-1592

**Property Tax Division** 

210 North 1950 West Salt Lake City, UT 84134 Respondent

Laron Lind

160 East 300 South, 5th Floor Salt Lake City, UT 84114 **Attorney for Respondent** 

Joshua Nelson

160 East 300 South, 5th Floor PO Box 140874 Salt Lake City, UT 84114-0874 **Attorney for Respondent** 

John McCarrey

160 East 300 South, 5th Floor Salt Lake City, UT 84114-0874 **Attorney for Respondent** 

**Carbon County Auditor** 

751 East 100 North Ste 1100 Price, UT 84501 **Affected County / Petitioner** 

**Iron County Auditor** 

P.O. Box 457 Parowan, UT 84761 **Affected County** 

**Daggett County Auditor** 

P.O. Box 219 Manila, UT 84046 Affected County / Petitioner

**Juab County Auditor** 

160 N Main Nephi, UT 84648 **Affected County** 

**Kane County Auditor** 

76 North Main Kanab, UT 84741 **Affected County** 

\*\*\*\* CERTIFICATION \*\*\*\*

I certify on this date I mailed a copy of the foregoing document addressed to each of the above named parties.

February 25, 2022

Signature

Date

### USTC – Appeal

### Certificate of Mailing

Utah State Tax Commission

19-1592

Deseret Generation and Transmission Cooperative (Petitioner) vs **Property Tax Division (Respondent) Affected County / Petitioner** Millard County Auditor 50 S Main Fillmore, UT 84631 **Affected County / Petitioner Uintah County Auditor** 147 E Main Vernal, UT 84078 Affected County / Petitioner **Duchesne County Auditor** P.O. Box 910 Duchesne, UT 84021 **Affected County / Petitioner Emery County Auditor** P.O. Box 907 Castle Dale, UT 84513 **Affected County Sevier County Auditor** 250 N Main Street Richfield, UT 84701 **Affected County / Petitioner Utah County Auditor** 111 S University Ave Provo, UT 84601 **Affected County Wasatch County Auditor** 25 North Main Heber, UT 84032 **Affected County Washington County Auditor** 197 East Tabernacle St George, UT 84770 **Affected County Sanpete County Auditor** PO Box 128 Manti, UT 84642 Affected County / Petitioner Salt Lake County Auditor 2001 South State Street, S3-600 Salt Lake City, UT 84190

\*\*\*\* CERTIFICATION \*\*\*\*
oregoing document addressed to

I certify on this date I mailed a copy of the foregoing document addressed to each of the above named parties.

February 25, 2022

Signature

Date

#### USTC – Appeal

### Certificate of Mailing

Utah State Tax Commission

Desertt Generation and Transmission Cooperative (Petitioner) vs Property Tax Division (Respondent) 19-1592

**Thomas Peters** 

7430 Creek Road Ste 303 Sandy, UT 84093 **Attorney for Affected County(s)** 

**Timothy A Bodily** 

Deputy Salt Lake County District Attorney 35 East 500 South Salt Lake City, UT 84111 **Attorney for Petitioner** 

Tyler Allred

Duchesne County Attorney's Office 734 North Center Street Duchesne, UT 84021-0270 Attorney for Affected County(s)

**Paul Jones** 

100 East Center, HCH 206 Provo, UT 84606 Attorney for Affected County(s)

Barton H. Kunz II

Goebel Anderson PC 405 South Main Street Ste 200 Salt Lake City, UT 84111 **Attorney for Affected County(s)** 

Jennifer Mastrorocco

Goebel Anderson PC 405 South Main Street Ste 200 Salt Lake City, UT 84111 **Attorney for Affected Counties** 

**David Detton** 

DKD Consulting, LLC 2018 Maple Grove Way Bountiful, UT 84010 Representative

**Deseret Generation and Transmission** 

Cooperative

David F Crabtree 10714 South Jordan Gateway South Jordan, UT 84095 Petitioner

\*\*\*\* CERTIFICATION \*\*\*\*

I certify on this date I mailed a copy of the foregoing document addressed to each of the above named parties.

February 25, 2022

Signature

Date