### CAPITALIZATION RATE STUDY FOR NATURAL RESOURCE PROPERTIES

**FOR: JANUARY 1, 2023** 



#### **UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION**

PROPERTY TAX DIVISION
UTILITIES & TRANSPORTATION SECTION
210 NORTH 1950 WEST, THIRD FLOOR
SALT LAKE CITY, UTAH 84134

(801) 291-3600

www.propertytax.utah.gov



# UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION PROPERTY TAX DIVISION SUMMARY OF EQUITY RATES AND CAPITAL STRUCTURE

4/1/2023

2023

Industry	Page	Equity Yield Rate	Debt Yield Rate	Debt/Equity	Industry WACC
COAL MINING	7	11.09%	9.85%	15% / 85%	10.91%
PRECIOUS METALS	11	9.30%	7.24%	20% / 80%	8.89%
NON-PRECIOUS METALS	15	12.89%	5.59%	15% / 85%	11.79%
NON-METALS	19	12.39%	5.59%	20% / 80%	11.03%
OIL & GAS PRODUCTION	23	13.73%	7.24%	20% / 80%	12.43%
OIL & GAS GATHERING	27	12.35%	7.24%	45% / 55%	10.05%
SAND AND GRAVEL	31	12.74%	5.59%	20% / 80%	11.31%
URANIUM MINING	35	10.59%	5.59%	5% / 95%	10.34%



# UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION PROPERTY TAX DIVISION SUMMARY OF WACC CALCULATIONS CONTINUED

4/1/2023

2023

Industry	Nominal Rate	Real Rate	Tax Rate Nominal Rate	e Loaded Real Rate
COAL MINING	10.91%	8.18%	14.05%	11.25%
PRECIOUS METALS	8.89%	6.21%	11.37%	8.63%
NON-PRECIOUS METALS	11.79%	9.04%	15.44%	12.61%
NON-METALS	11.03%	8.30%	14.33%	11.52%
OIL & GAS PRODUCTION/WD	12.43%	9.67%	16.09%	13.24%
OIL & GAS GATHERING	10.05%	7.34%	12.31%	9.55%
SAND AND GRAVEL	11.31%	8.58%	14.71%	11.89%
URANIUM MINING	10.34%	7.63%	13.70%	10.90%

<sup>\*</sup>Nominal Rate (NR) includes both the real rate and the impact of inflation (IR) Real Rate = [(1+NR)/(1+IR)]-1



# UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION PROPERTY TAX DIVISION DESCRIPTION OF EQUITY MODELS

4/1/2023

2023

Page 3

The Property Tax Division of the Utah State Tax Commission ("Division") estimates the market cost of equity for the industries it is required to assess for property tax purposes according to Utah Law. The Division estimates the market cost of equity using recognized equity models based on financial literature, research, and guidance from Utah Tax Commission Administrative Rule R884-24P-62 ("Rule 62"). The Division develops several market-based equity models including various Capital Asset Pricing Models ("CAPM") and Dividend Growth Models ("DGM"). The following is a summary of each of these models.

#### **CAPM**

The Division uses three CAPM cost of equity models: CAPM: Rule 62, CAPM: Supply Side, and CAPM: Implied Equity Risk Premium. Each of these CAPMs are based on the formula:

K(e) = R(f) + (Beta x Equity Risk Premium)

Where:

K(e) = the estimated market cost of equity

R(f) = the current risk free rate

Beta = a measure of the volatility of an individual stock compared to the volatility of the market as a whole.

Equity Risk Premium = the premium investors require above the return on a risk free investment. In other words, the additional return investors require for investing in risky securities vs. risk free securities. The Equity Risk Premium is also commonly referred to as the Market Risk Premium.

The difference between the three CAPMs that the Division calculates is how the Equity Risk Premium is estimated.

#### **CAPM: RULE 62**

Utah Tax Commission Administrative Code R884-24P-62 ("Rule 62") states that the CAPM is the "preferred method for estimating the cost of equity" (Utah Tax Code R884-24P-62 (5)(b)(i)(B)(II)(Aa)). Rule 62 also states that "more than one method may be used to correlate a cost of equity, but only if the CAPM method is weighted at least 50% in the correlation" (Utah Tax Code R884-24P-64

Rule 62 requires the Division to use or estimate the inputs for this CAPM as follows:

- The risk free rate shall be the current market rate on 20-year Treasury bonds.
- The beta should reflect an average or value-weighted average of comparable companies and should be drawn from Value Line or an equivalent source.
- The Risk Premium shall be the arithmetic average of the spread between the return on stocks and the income return on long-term bonds for the entire historical period contained in the Ibbotson Yearbook published immediately following the lien date.<sup>1</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This information is now provided by Kroll



# UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION PROPERTY TAX DIVISION DESCRIPTION OF EQUITY MODELS

4/1/2023

2023

Page 4

#### **CAPM: Supply Side**

The CAPM: Supply Side uses the same inputs as the CAPM: Rule 62 except that the Supply Side uses an Equity Risk Premium that is based on the historical returns of companies in the form of earnings, dividends, and capital gains. Ibbotson states that "investors should not expect a much higher or lower return than that produced by the companies in the real economy." This earnings model separates the Equity Risk Premium into four sections: inflation, income growth, growth in real earnings, and growth of the Price Earnings Ratio ("P/E Ratio"). In other words, CAPM: Supply Side ignores the historical returns that have resulted in the change in the P/E ratio. The Division uses the Supply Side Equity Risk Premium published by Kroll.

#### **CAPM: Implied Equity Risk Premium**

Professor Damodaran from the Stern School of Business at New York University estimates the Equity Risk Premium by using current market data to extract the premium currently required by investors. Dr. Damodaran relies on the price of the S&P 500 index and the expected future cash flows of the index (including dividends and share repurchases) to estimate the current implied expected return on the market.<sup>3</sup> This expected return is then compared to the current return on the risk free rate to derive an implied equity risk premium. The Division adjusts Dr. Damodaran's model, which is compared to a 10-year Treasury bond, to compare it to the 20-year Treasury bond that the Division uses in its other CAPM models.



# UTAH STATE TAX COMMISSION PROPERTY TAX DIVISION DESCRIPTION OF EQUITY MODELS

4/1/2023

2023

Page 5

#### **DGM**

The Division uses four multi-stage DGM cost of equity models: two models based on the methodology of Dr. Aswath Damodaran and two based on the methodology of Dr. Bradford Cornell. All of these models start with a short-term growth rate that is then adjusted, over a period of years, to a more sustainable long-term growth rate. The basic formula for a DGM is:

$$K(e) = (D1/P0) + g$$

Where:

K(e) = the estimated cost of equity

D1 = next years expected dividend (including stock buybacks)

P0 = current stock price

g = the expected growth in dividends (including stock buybacks)

#### **Damodaran DGM**

This DGM model is based on the same mathematic structure that Dr. Damodaran uses to calculate the Implied Equity Risk Premium, but does so for each company with a positive payout ratio. The first stage of the model grows the earnings per share linearly for five years from Valueline's next year EPS estimate to the 3-5 year EPS estimate. The company's specific payout ratio is used to determine the total expected payout to shareholders. In year 5 a terminal value is calculated using a perpetual growth rate equal to the latest Congressional Budget Office's estimation of long-term economic growth. An internal rate of return calculation is then applied to the estimate of cash flows available to equity holders (including the terminal value) to determine the implied cost of equity.

#### Damodaran DGM (AP) Adjusted Payout

This DGM model is the same as the DGM Damodaran model but it adjusts the payout ratio to a sustainable level developed by Dr. Damodaran. This sustainable payout ratio is calculated as 1-(g/ROE) where g is the Congressional Budget Office's estimation of long term economic growth and the ROE is the industry average, weighted average, or median long term ROE from Valueline. The payout ratio is adjusted linearly over five years from the company specific payout ratio to the industry specific sustainable payout ratio.

#### Cornell 3-Stage DGM and Cornell (AP) Adjusted Payout

This 3-stage DGM follows the model put forth in "The Equity Risk Premium" by Bradford Cornell. This model uses the 5 year growth estimate provided by Value Line, then that growth rate converges linearly to the long-term growth rate over a 15 year period. In year 20, a terminal value is calculated iteratively using the V = (CFn+1) / (k-g) formula. An internal rate of return calculation is then applied to the estimate of cash flows available to equity holders (including the terminal value) to determine the implied cost of equity that will equal the current stock price. In the adjusted payout model the payout ratio is adjusted linearly over fifteen years from the company specific payout ratio to the industry specific sustainable payout ratio.



# PROPERTY TAX DIVISION KEY RATES AND FIGURES

4/1/2023

2023

Page 6

CORPORATE BONDS					
Aaa		4.43%			
Aa		4.77%			
Α		5.12%			
Ваа		5.59%			
Ba1		7.24%			
Ba2		8.11%			
Ba3		8.98%			
B1		9.85%			
В2		10.72%			
В3		11.59%			
Caa1		12.46%			
Caa2		13.33%			
Caa3		14.20%			
Ca		15.07%			
С		15.94%			

PUBLIC UTILITY BONDS			
Aaa		N/A	
Aa		5.06%	
Α		5.28%	
Baa		5.57%	

PREFERRED STOCKS				
Aaa		N/A		
Aa		N/A		
Α		N/A		
Baa		N/A		

MISCELLANEOUS RATES		
Airline 'TEFRA' Relief Factor	7.76%	
4-R Act Relief for Railroads	19.52%	
4-R Act Relief (BNSF only)	7.75%	
TIPS Inflationary Estimate	2.52%	
Marginal Income Tax Rate	25.00%	
GDP Price Deflator Forecast	N/A	
Long Term Growth Rate	3.90%	

INFLATION FACTORS				
	4th Qrtr.	Annual		
	GDP Implicit	Percent	Conversion	
Year	Price Deflator	Change	Factor	
2012	100.73	2.07%	1.284	
2013	102.55	1.81%	1.262	
2014	104.10	1.52%	1.243	
2015	104.93	0.80%	1.233	
2016	106.47	1.47%	1.215	
2017	108.64	2.04%	1.191	
2018	111.16	2.32%	1.164	
2019	112.91	1.58%	1.146	
2020	114.74	1.62%	1.128	
2021	121.76	6.11%	1.063	
2022	129.37	6.26%	1.000	

2023 - 2013 Average Change: 2.55%

Source:

U.S. Department of Commerce: Bureau of Economic Analysis Gross Domestic Product: Implicit Price Deflator

MARKET RISK PREMIUMS				
Full Term Historical Risk Premium	7.17%			
Supply Side Risk Premium	6.35%			
Damodaran Implied ERP	4.96%			
Risk Free Rate	4.14%			

#### **MISCELLANEOUS INFORMATION**

Stock prices are from the last trading day of 2022. Retrieved from http://finance.yahoo.com/

Bond yield information derived from the January 2023 Mergent bond record.

Company and industry data was taken from the last Value Line tear sheet of 2022.

Damodaran Implied Risk Premium Model Calculated Based on Model Found at: http://pages.stern.nyu.edu/~adamodar/

Full term historical and supply side RP are taken from: Kroll



4/1/2023

2023

Page 7

### **COAL MINING -- EQUITY RATE SUMMARY**

RECONCILIATION					
Equity Models		Weight	Equity Rate		
CAPM: RULE 62		100%	11.09%		
CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE		0%	10.31%		
CAPM: IMPLIED ERP		0%	8.95%		
DGM: DAMODARAN		0%	NMF		
DGM: DAMODARAN (AP)		0%	NMF		
DGM: CORNELL		0%	NMF		
DGM: CORNELL (AP)		0%	NMF		
Reconciled Equity Ra	te		11.09%		
Reconciled Debt Rat	e		9.85%		
Debt/Equity Structur	re		15% / 85%		
WACC Conclusion			10.91%		



4/1/2023

2023

Page 8

### **COAL MINING -- COMPANY INFORMATION**

CALCULATION OF CAPITAL STRUCTURE				
Market Value Market Value Percent Perce				
Company	Of Equity*	Of Debt*	Equity	Debt
Alliance Resource Partners LP	2,584.61	435.13	86%	14%
Alpha Metallurgical Resources	2,269.05	15.46	99%	1%
Arch Resources	2,500.31	239.81	91%	9%
Hallador Energy Company	329.50	101.97	76%	24%
Peabody Energy	4,943.18	587.80	89%	11%
Ramaco Resources Inc	388.13	101.99	79%	21%
SunCoke Energy Inc	719.85	471.90	60%	40%
Warrior Met Coal Inc	1,789.28	337.49	84%	16%
Select	ted Equity and Debt Sti	ructure	85%	15%

GUIDELINE COMPANY INFORMATION SUMMARY					
	Return		Credit	Debt	
Company	On Equity	Beta	Rating	Rate	
Alliance Resource Partners LP	N/A	1.10	Ba3	8.98%	
Alpha Metallurgical Resources	N/A	1.20	B2	10.72%	
Arch Resources	N/A	0.75	B1	9.85%	
Hallador Energy Company	N/A	0.90	N/A	N/A	
Peabody Energy	N/A	0.95	B2	10.72%	
Ramaco Resources Inc	N/A	0.90	N/A	N/A	
SunCoke Energy Inc	N/A	1.10	B1	9.85%	
Warrior Met Coal Inc	N/A	0.85	B1	9.85%	
Selected for Industry	NMF	0.97	B1	9.85%	

<sup>\*</sup> Amounts in Millions



4/1/2023 **2023** 

**COAL MINING -- EQUITY MODELS** 

CAPM: RULE 62 COMPLIANT				
Market Risk Premium	7.17%			
X Industry Beta	0.97			
Industry Risk Premium	6.95%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	11.09%			

CAPM: IMPLIED ERP				
Market Risk Premium	4.96%			
X Industry Beta	0.97			
Industry Risk Premium	4.81%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	8.95%			

CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE				
Market Risk Premium	6.35%			
X Industry Beta	0.97			
Industry Risk Premium	6.16%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	10.30%			

MULTISTA	AGE DIVIDEND	GROWTH MOI	DEL			
	Indicated Rates					
Company Name	Damodaran's	Damodaran's AP	Cornell's	Cornell's AP		
Alliance Resource Partners LP	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Alpha Metallurgical Resources	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Arch Resources	21.74%	N/A	30.79%	N/A		
Hallador Energy Company	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Peabody Energy	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Ramaco Resources Inc	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
SunCoke Energy Inc	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Warrior Met Coal Inc	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Selected Rate	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF		



2023

4/1/2023

**COAL MINING -- DGM INPUTS** 

DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL INPUTS						
	Stock	Next Year's	Next Year's	3-5 Year	Projected	
Company Name	Price	Payout	EPS	EPS	Growth	
Alliance Resource Partners LP	20.32	0.26	5.62	N/A	-28.00%	
Alpha Metallurgical Resources	146.39	14.48	29.45	N/A	N/A	
Arch Resources	142.79	4.74	52.95	70.20	-28.00%	
Hallador Energy Company	9.99	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Peabody Energy	26.42	2.79	5.07	N/A	N/A	
Ramaco Resources Inc	8.79	N/A	2.70	N/A	N/A	
SunCoke Energy Inc	8.63	0.61	0.73	N/A	N/A	
Warrior Met Coal Inc	34.64	0.85	6.43	N/A	N/A	



4/1/2023

2023

Page 11

### PRECIOUS METALS -- EQUITY RATE SUMMARY

	RECONCILIATION		
Equity Models		Weight	Equity Rate
CAPM: RULE 62		100%	9.30%
CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE		0%	8.72%
CAPM: IMPLIED ERP		0%	7.71%
DGM: DAMODARAN		0%	9.85%
DGM: DAMODARAN (AP)		0%	9.84%
DGM: CORNELL		0%	10.25%
DGM: CORNELL (AP)		0%	9.93%
Reconciled Equity Rat	e		9.30%
Reconciled Debt Rate			7.24%
Debt/Equity Structure	e		20% / 80%
WACC Conclusion			8.89%



4/1/2023

2023

**PRECIOUS METALS -- COMPANY INFORMATION** 

Page 12

	Market Value	Market Value	Percent	Percen
Company	Of Equity*	Of Debt*	Equity	Debt
Agnico Eagle Mines Ltd (AEM)	23,731.63	1,493.31	94%	6%
Barrick Gold Corporation (GOLD)	30,156.91	4,922.00	86%	14%
Coeur Mining (CDE)	993.54	465.15	68%	32%
Hecla Mining Company (HL)	3,378.36	538.13	86%	14%
Kinross Gold Corporation (KGC)	4,997.54	2,659.30	65%	35%
Newmont Corp (NEM)	37,429.60	5,697.00	87%	13%
SSR Mining Inc (SSRM)	3,238.25	455.49	88%	12%

**Selected Equity and Debt Structure** 

80%

20%

GUIDELINE COM	GUIDELINE COMPANY INFORMATION SUMMARY					
	Return		Credit	Debt		
Company	On Equity	Beta	Rating	Rate		
Agnico Eagle Mines Ltd (AEM)	12.50%	0.60	Baa2	5.59%		
Barrick Gold Corporation (GOLD)	8.00%	0.60	A3	5.12%		
Coeur Mining (CDE)	25.00%	0.95	В3	11.59%		
Hecla Mining Company (HL)	13.00%	0.95	B1	9.85%		
Kinross Gold Corporation (KGC)	10.50%	0.65	Baa3	5.59%		
Newmont Corp (NEM)	11.50%	0.60	Baa1	5.59%		
SSR Mining Inc (SSRM)	11.50%	0.70	N/A	N/A		
Selected for Industry	13.14%	0.72	Ba1	7.24%		

<sup>\*</sup> Amounts in Millions



4/1/2023

2023

PRECIOUS METALS -- EQUITY MODELS

CAPM: RULE 62 COMPLI	ANT
Market Risk Premium	7.17%
X Industry Beta	0.72
Industry Risk Premium	5.16%
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%
Indicated Rate	9.30%

CAPM: IMPLIED ERP				
Market Risk Premium	4.96%			
X Industry Beta	0.72			
Industry Risk Premium	3.57%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	7.71%			

CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE				
Market Risk Premium	6.35%			
X Industry Beta	0.72			
Industry Risk Premium	4.57%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	8.71%			

MULTISTAGE DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL				
		Indicate	d Rates	
Company Name	Damodaran's	Damodaran's AP	Cornell's	Cornell's AP
Agnico Eagle Mines Ltd (AEM)	9.61%	9.87%	14.22%	14.44%
Barrick Gold Corporation (GOLD)	6.64%	7.97%	7.67%	7.22%
Coeur Mining (CDE)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Hecla Mining Company (HL)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Kinross Gold Corporation (KGC)	6.69%	11.58%	6.49%	6.93%
Newmont Corp (NEM)	14.63%	9.33%	13.44%	12.78%
SSR Mining Inc (SSRM)	11.67%	12.09%	13.63%	15.45%
Selected Rate	9.85%	9.84%	10.25%	9.93%



4/1/2023 **2023** 

Page 14

### **PRECIOUS METALS -- DGM INPUTS**

DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL INPUTS					
	Stock	Next Year's	Next Year's	3-5 Year	Projected
Company Name	Price	Payout	EPS	EPS	Growth
Agnico Eagle Mines Ltd (AEM)	51.99	1.80	2.70	5.45	20.50%
Barrick Gold Corporation (GOLD)	17.18	0.64	0.90	1.20	4.00%
Coeur Mining (CDE)	3.36	N/A	0.05	0.90	N/A
Hecla Mining Company (HL)	5.56	0.02	0.10	0.45	N/A
Kinross Gold Corporation (KGC)	4.09	0.12	0.25	0.60	2.50%
Newmont Corp (NEM)	47.20	3.14	2.50	4.00	9.50%
SSR Mining Inc (SSRM)	15.67	0.73	1.35	2.25	15.00%



4/1/2023

2023

Page 15

### NON-PRECIOUS METALS -- EQUITY RATE SUMMARY

	RECONCILIATION		
Equity Models		Weight	Equity Rate
CAPM: RULE 62		100%	12.89%
CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE		0%	11.90%
CAPM: IMPLIED ERP		0%	10.19%
DGM: DAMODARAN		0%	9.96%
DGM: DAMODARAN (AP)		0%	13.25%
DGM: CORNELL		0%	16.58%
DGM: CORNELL (AP)		0%	13.64%
Reconciled Equity Ra	te		12.89%
Reconciled Debt Rat	re		5.59%
Debt/Equity Structu	re		15% / 85%
WACC Conclusion			11.79%



4/1/2023

2023

**NON-PRECIOUS METALS -- COMPANY INFORMATION** 

CALCULATION OF CAPITAL STRUCTURE				
	Market Value	Market Value	Percent	Percent
Company	Of Equity*	Of Debt*	Equity	Debt
BHP Group Ltd ADR (BHP)	314,221.20	14,715.00	96%	4%
Freep't-McMoRan Inc (FCX)	61,294.00	10,429.00	85%	15%
Materion Corporation (MTRN)	2,375.72	514.80	82%	18%
Rio Tinto Plc (RIO)	115,405.59	11,192.00	91%	9%
Southern Copper Corp (SCCO)	53,420.99	7,278.20	88%	12%
Teck Resources 'B' (TECKB.TO)	19,328.83	7,345.65	72%	28%
Hudbay Minerals (HBM)	1,328.44	1,152.04	54%	46%
Lundin Mining (LUN.TO)	4,665.82	197.33	96%	4%
Selecte	d Equity and Debt Sti	ucture	85%	15%

GUIDELINE COMP	ANY INFORM	ATION SUIV	IMARY	
	Return		Credit	Debt
Company	On Equity	Beta	Rating	Rate
BHP Group Ltd ADR (BHP)	35.50%	1.05	A1	5.12%
Freep't-McMoRan Inc (FCX)	42.50%	1.50	Baa3	5.59%
Materion Corporation (MTRN)	13.00%	1.15	N/A	N/A
Rio Tinto Plc (RIO)	33.50%	1.05	A2	5.12%
Southern Copper Corp (SCCO)	25.50%	1.15	Baa1	5.59%
Teck Resources 'B' (TECKB.TO)	13.00%	1.05	Baa3	5.59%
Hudbay Minerals (HBM)	10.50%	1.60	B1	9.85%
Lundin Mining (LUN.TO)	19.00%	1.20	N/A	N/A
Selected for Industry	24.06%	1.22	Baa2	5.59%

<sup>\*</sup>Amount in Millions



4/1/2023 **2023** 

**NON-PRECIOUS METALS -- EQUITY MODELS** 

CAPM: RULE 62 COMPLIANT				
Market Risk Premium	7.17%			
X Industry Beta	1.22			
Industry Risk Premium	8.75%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	12.89%			

CAPM: IMPLIED ERP			
Market Risk Premium	4.96%		
X Industry Beta	1.22		
Industry Risk Premium	6.05%		
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%		
Indicated Rate	10.19%		

CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE				
Market Risk Premium	6.35%			
X Industry Beta	1.22			
Industry Risk Premium	7.75%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	11.89%			

MULTISTAGE DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL					
		Indicate	d Rates		
Company Name	Damodaran's	Damodaran's AP	Cornell's	Cornell's AP	
BHP Group Ltd ADR (BHP)	11.40%	12.34%	15.42%	12.37%	
Freep't-McMoRan Inc (FCX)	7.66%	12.56%	17.03%	21.18%	
Materion Corporation (MTRN)	5.28%	9.54%	5.80%	12.20%	
Rio Tinto Plc (RIO)	15.47%	16.73%	15.24%	16.21%	
Southern Copper Corp (SCCO)	8.61%	8.75%	8.59%	9.50%	
Teck Resources 'B' (TECKB.TO)	5.71%	12.39%	10.60%	23.08%	
Hudbay Minerals (HBM)	N/A	15.20%	N/A	N/A	
Lundin Mining (LUN.TO)	15.58%	18.46%	22.80%	21.55%	
Selected Rate	9.96%	13.25%	16.58%	13.64%	



4/1/2023

**2023** Page 18

### **NON-PRECIOUS METALS -- DGM INPUTS**

DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL INPUTS					
	Stock	Next Year's	Next Year's	3-5 Year	Projected
Company Name	Price	Payout	EPS	EPS	Growth
BHP Group Ltd ADR (BHP)	62.05	5.80	5.30	7.65	7.50%
Freep't-McMoRan Inc (FCX)	38.00	1.18	3.40	5.15	27.50%
Materion Corporation (MTRN)	87.51	0.54	5.55	7.50	16.00%
Rio Tinto Plc (RIO)	71.20	6.94	9.85	13.45	6.50%
Southern Copper Corp (SCCO)	60.39	2.30	3.35	4.10	6.50%
Teck Resources 'B' (TECKB.TO)	37.63	0.37	4.67	4.96	29.00%
Hudbay Minerals (HBM)	5.07	0.02	0.65	1.00	N/A
Lundin Mining (LUN.TO)	6.11	0.52	0.66	1.47	20.50%



4/1/2023

2023

Page 19

### NON-METALS -- EQUITY RATE SUMMARY

	RECONCILIATION		
Equity Models		Weight	Equity Rate
CAPM: RULE 62		100%	12.39%
CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE		0%	11.45%
CAPM: IMPLIED ERP		0%	9.84%
DGM: DAMODARAN		0%	11.81%
DGM: DAMODARAN (AP)		0%	9.66%
DGM: CORNELL		0%	11.50%
DGM: CORNELL (AP)		0%	14.09%
Reconciled Equity Ra	te		12.39%
Reconciled Debt Rat	e		5.59%
Debt/Equity Structur	re		20% / 80%
WACC Conclusion			11.03%



4/1/2023

2023

**NON-METALS -- COMPANY INFORMATION** 

Page 20

	Market Value	Market Value	Percent	Percent
Company	Of Equity*	Of Debt*	Equity	Debt
Compass Minerals International Inc (CMP)	1,730.12	864.90	67%	33%
Eagle Materials Inc (EXP)	4,814.79	933.97	84%	16%
Intrepid Potash Inc (IPI)	366.30	3.81	99%	1%
Martin Marietta Materials Inc (MLM)	20,987.94	4,947.90	81%	19%
Mosaic Company New (MOS)	14,875.06	3,687.30	80%	20%
Vulcan Materials (VMC)	23,272.12	4,426.00	84%	16%

**Selected Equity and Debt Structure** 

80%

20%

GUIDELINE COMPANY INFORMATION SUMMARY				
	Return		Credit	Debt
Company	On Equity	Beta	Rating	Rate
Compass Minerals International Inc (CMP)	16.00%	1.05	N/A	N/A
Eagle Materials Inc (EXP)	17.00%	1.25	Ba3	8.98%
Intrepid Potash Inc (IPI)	N/A	1.15	Baa2	5.59%
Martin Marietta Materials Inc (MLM)	9.50%	1.15	N/A	N/A
Mosaic Company New (MOS)	16.00%	1.20	Baa2	5.59%
Vulcan Materials (VMC)	14.50%	1.10	Baa2	5.59%
Selected for Industry	14.60%	1.15	ВааЗ	5.59%



4/1/2023 **2023** 

**NON-METALS -- EQUITY MODELS** 

CAPM: RULE 62 COMPLIANT			
Market Risk Premium	7.17%		
X Industry Beta	1.15		
Industry Risk Premium	8.25%		
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%		
Indicated Rate	12.39%		

CAPM: IMPLIED ERP			
Market Risk Premium	4.96%		
X Industry Beta	1.15		
Industry Risk Premium	5.70%		
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%		
Indicated Rate	9.84%		

CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE	
Market Risk Premium	6.35%
X Industry Beta	1.15
Industry Risk Premium	7.30%
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%
Indicated Rate	11.44%

MULTISTAGE DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL				
	Indicated Rates			
Company Name	Damodaran's	Damodaran's AP	Cornell's	Cornell's AP
Compass Minerals Internati	0.00%	9.49%	17.43%	18.38%
Eagle Materials Inc (EXP)	11.65%	9.82%	10.71%	13.88%
Intrepid Potash Inc (IPI)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Martin Marietta Materials Inc (MLM)	4.67%	6.55%	4.73%	6.54%
Mosaic Company New (MOS)	25.87%	15.85%	32.18%	0.00%
Vulcan Materials (VMC)	5.05%	6.60%	5.41%	7.21%
Selected Rate	11.81%	9.66%	11.50%	14.09%



**NON-METALS -- DGM INPUTS** 

4/1/2023

2023

DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL INPUTS					
	Stock	Next Year's	Next Year's	3-5 Year	Projected
Company Name	Price	Payout	EPS	EPS	Growth
Compass Minerals International Inc (CI	41.00	0.65	1.10	4.00	38.09%
Eagle Materials Inc (EXP)	132.85	6.47	11.25	11.90	8.50%
Intrepid Potash Inc (IPI)	28.87	1.15	4.95	N/A	N/A
Martin Marietta Materials Inc (MLM)	337.97	2.64	14.05	14.70	4.50%
Mosaic Company New (MOS)	43.87	3.13	10.50	12.15	37.50%
Vulcan Materials (VMC)	175.11	1.70	6.25	7.75	8.50%



4/1/2023

2023

Page 23

### OIL & GAS PRODUCTION -- EQUITY RATE SUMMARY

	RECONCILIATION		
Equity Models		Weight	Equity Rate
CAPM: RULE 62		60%	14.61%
CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE		20%	13.43%
CAPM: IMPLIED ERP		20%	11.38%
DGM: DAMODARAN		0%	16.33%
DGM: DAMODARAN (AP)		0%	11.68%
DGM: CORNELL		0%	17.98%
DGM: CORNELL (AP)		0%	23.21%
Reconciled Equity Ra	te		13.73%
Reconciled Debt Rat	e		7.24%
Debt/Equity Structur	re		20% / 80%
WACC Conclusion			12.43%



4/1/2023

2023

**OIL & GAS PRODUCTION -- COMPANY INFORMATION** 

CALCULATION OF CAPITAL STRUCTURE				
	Market Value	Market Value	Percent	Percent
Company	Of Equity*	Of Debt*	Equity	Debt
BLACK STONE MINERALS	3,532.70	13.73	100%	0%
CALLON PETROLEUM	2,285.54	2,202.16	51%	49%
DEVON ENERGY	40,166.03	6,509.00	86%	14%
DIAMONDBACK ENERGY	24,598.62	5,885.00	81%	19%
OCCIDENTAL PETROLEUM	69,195.31	18,695.00	79%	21%
OVINTIV INC	12,459.45	4,571.00	73%	27%
PDC ENERGY	5,663.96	1,332.20	81%	19%
PIONEER NATURAL RES	55,887.80	6,569.00	89%	11%
SM ENERGY CO	4,246.88	1,567.68	73%	27%
SOUTHWESTERN ENERGY	6,795.04	4,250.00	62%	38%
Sel	ected Equity and Debt St	ructure	80%	20%

GUIDELINE COMPANY INFORMATION SUMMARY				
	Return		Credit	Debt
Company	On Equity	Beta	Rating	Rate
BLACK STONE MINERALS	18.50%	1.10	N/A	N/A
CALLON PETROLEUM	19.50%	1.95	B2	10.72%
DEVON ENERGY	33.00%	1.50	Baa2	5.59%
DIAMONDBACK ENERGY	8.50%	1.55	Baa2	5.59%
OCCIDENTAL PETROLEUM	17.50%	1.55	Ba1	7.24%
OVINTIV INC	28.50%	1.60	Baa3	5.59%
PDC ENERGY	7.00%	1.45	Ba2	8.11%
PIONEER NATURAL RES	19.50%	1.25	Baa1	5.59%
SM ENERGY CO	N/A	1.75	B1	9.85%
SOUTHWESTERN ENERGY	31.00%	0.85	Ba1	7.24%
Selected for Industry	20.33%	1.46	Ba1	7.24%

<sup>\*</sup>Amount in Millions



2023

4/1/2023

**OIL & GAS PRODUCTION -- EQUITY MODELS** 

CAPM: RULE 62 COMPL	.IANT
Market Risk Premium	7.17%
X Industry Beta	1.46
Industry Risk Premium	10.47%
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%
Indicated Rate	14.61%

CAPM: IMPLIED ERP			
Market Risk Premium	4.96%		
X Industry Beta	1.46		
Industry Risk Premium	7.24%		
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%		
Indicated Rate	11.38%		

CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE			
Market Risk Premium	6.35%		
X Industry Beta	1.46		
Industry Risk Premium	9.27%		
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%		
Indicated Rate	13.41%		

DIVISION'S RISK PREMIUM		

MULTISTAGE DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL					
		Indicated Rates			
Company Name	Damodaran's	Damodaran's AP	Cornell's	Cornell's AP	
BLACK STONE MINERALS	8.80%	7.91%	14.41%	6.71%	
CALLON PETROLEUM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
DEVON ENERGY	25.07%	16.83%	29.65%	N/A	
DIAMONDBACK ENERGY	9.03%	8.80%	N/A	N/A	
OCCIDENTAL PETROLEUM	24.90%	14.09%	N/A	N/A	
OVINTIV INC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
PDC ENERGY	15.10%	10.32%	N/A	N/A	
PIONEER NATURAL RES	15.09%	12.12%	25.56%	29.25%	
SM ENERGY CO	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
SOUTHWESTERN ENERGY	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Selected Rate	16.33%	11.68%	17.98%	23.21%	



4/1/2023 **2023** 

**OIL & GAS PRODUCTION -- DGM INPUTS** 

DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL INPUTS					
	Stock	Next Year's	Next Year's	3-5 Year	Projected
Company Name	Price	Payout	EPS	EPS	Growth
BLACK STONE MINERALS	16.87	1.66	0.50	1.00	5.00%
CALLON PETROLEUM	37.09	N/A	16.30	17.40	18.00%
DEVON ENERGY	61.51	4.46	9.35	9.10	33.50%
DIAMONDBACK ENERGY	136.78	3.50	10.20	9.35	N/A
OCCIDENTAL PETROLEUM	62.99	0.73	7.50	6.75	N/A
OVINTIV INC	50.71	5.62	15.25	13.50	29.50%
PDC ENERGY	63.48	6.07	8.85	4.25	N/A
PIONEER NATURAL RES	228.39	23.17	27.25	24.00	21.00%
SM ENERGY CO	34.83	2.11	10.04	N/A	N/A
SOUTHWESTERN ENERGY	5.85	0.73	1.75	2.50	24.00%



4/1/2023

2023

Page 27

### OIL & GAS GATHERING -- EQUITY RATE SUMMARY

RECONCILIATION				
Equity Models		Weight	Equity Rate	
CAPM: RULE 62		60%	13.10%	
CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE		20%	12.09%	
CAPM: IMPLIED ERP		20%	10.34%	
DGM: DAMODARAN		0%	18.72%	
DGM: DAMODARAN (AP)		0%	13.52%	
DGM: CORNELL		0%	20.37%	
DGM: CORNELL (AP)		0%	16.18%	
Reconciled Equity Ra	re		12.35%	
Reconciled Debt Rat	e		7.24%	
Debt/Equity Structur	e		45% / 55%	
WACC Conclusion			10.05%	



4/1/2023

2023

**OIL & GAS GATHERING -- COMPANY INFORMATION** 

CALCULATION OF CAPITAL STRUCTURE						
	Market Value	Market Value	Percent	Percent		
Company	Of Equity*	Of Debt*	Equity	Debt		
Cheniere Energy	36,545.85	26,391.00	58%	42%		
Crestwood Equity Partners Lp	2,740.69	3,282.50	46%	54%		
Energy Transfer Lp	36,731.07	49,105.00	43%	57%		
Holly Energy Partners L.P.	2,291.10	1,590.25	59%	41%		
Kinder Morgan	40,638.08	30,357.00	57%	43%		
Oneok, Inc	29,378.27	12,823.49	70%	30%		
Plains All American Pipeline	8,212.65	8,025.00	51%	49%		
Summit Midstream Partners Lp	169.85	1,431.97	11%	89%		
Western Midstream Partners	10,312.31	6,158.94	63%	37%		
Williams Companies	41,223.70	21,742.00	65%	35%		
Selected	Selected Equity and Debt Structure					

	Return		Credit	Debt
Company	On Equity	Beta	Rating	Rate
Cheniere Energy	50.50%	1.00	Ba1	7.24%
Crestwood Equity Partners Lp	21.00%	1.40	Ba2	8.11%
Energy Transfer Lp	20.00%	1.15	Baa3	5.59%
Holly Energy Partners L.P.	26.00%	0.95	Ba2	8.11%
Kinder Morgan	10.00%	1.15	Baa2	5.59%
Oneok, Inc	31.00%	1.45	Baa3	5.59%
Plains All American Pipeline	15.00%	1.45	Baa3	5.59%
Summit Midstream Partners Lp	N/A	1.60	В3	11.59%
Western Midstream Partners	44.00%	1.35	N/A	N/A
Williams Companies	20.00%	1.15	Baa2	5.59%
Selected for Industry	26.39%	1.25	Ba1	7.24%

<sup>\*</sup>Amounts in Millions



4/1/2023 **2023** 

OIL & GAS GATHERING -- EQUITY MODELS

CAPM: RULE 62 COMPLIA	ANT
Market Risk Premium	7.17%
X Industry Beta	1.25
Industry Risk Premium	8.96%
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%
Indicated Rate	13.10%

CAPM: IMPLIED ERP					
Market Risk Premium	4.96%				
X Industry Beta	1.25				
Industry Risk Premium	6.20%				
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%				
Indicated Rate	10.34%				

CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE				
Market Risk Premium	6.35%			
X Industry Beta	1.25			
Industry Risk Premium	7.94%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	12.08%			

MULTISTAGE DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL					
		ı	Indicated Rates		
Company Name	Damodaran's	Damodaran's AP	Cornell's	Cornell's AP	
Cheniere Energy	5.66%	6.55%	N/A	N/A	
Crestwood Equity Partners	30.35%	13.89%	N/A	N/A	
Energy Transfer Lp	20.76%	18.24%	15.08%	21.87%	
Holly Energy Partners L.P.	17.48%	15.64%	13.88%	18.19%	
Kinder Morgan	18.66%	11.60%	22.63%	25.58%	
Oneok, Inc	12.99%	10.51%	13.91%	14.82%	
Plains All American Pipeline	29.80%	20.94%	N/A	N/A	
Summit Midstream Partner	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Western Midstream Partne	15.82%	14.58%	18.52%	22.71%	
Williams Companies	16.90%	9.76%	13.06%	19.07%	
Selected Rate	18.72%	13.52%	20.37%	16.18%	



2023

4/1/2023

**OIL & GAS GATHERING -- DGM INPUTS** 

DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL INPUTS					
	Stock	Next Year's	Next Year's	3-5 Year	Projected
Company Name	Price	Payout	EPS	EPS	Growth
Cheniere Energy	149.96	1.64	3.85	5.58	N/A
Crestwood Equity Partners Lp	26.19	2.62	0.50	3.50	N/A
Energy Transfer Lp	11.87	0.92	1.60	2.35	10.00%
Holly Energy Partners L.P.	18.12	1.40	2.15	2.90	8.00%
Kinder Morgan	18.08	1.64	1.25	1.70	19.00%
Oneok, Inc	65.70	4.05	4.20	5.80	11.50%
Plains All American Pipeline	11.76	1.34	1.40	2.65	N/A
Summit Midstream Partners Lp	16.68	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Western Midstream Partners	26.85	2.15	3.20	3.85	15.00%
Williams Companies	32.90	1.76	1.85	2.30	12.00%



4/1/2023

2023

Page 31

### SAND AND GRAVEL -- EQUITY RATE SUMMARY

	RECONCILIATION		
Equity Models		Weight	Equity Rate
CAPM: RULE 62		100%	12.74%
CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE		0%	11.77%
CAPM: IMPLIED ERP		0%	10.09%
DGM: DAMODARAN		0%	7.85%
DGM: DAMODARAN (AP)		0%	8.43%
DGM: CORNELL		0%	10.41%
DGM: CORNELL (AP)		0%	8.43%
Reconciled Equity Rat	te		12.74%
Reconciled Debt Rate	e		5.59%
Debt/Equity Structur	e		20% / 80%
WACC Conclusion			11.31%



4/1/2023

2023

**SAND AND GRAVEL -- COMPANY INFORMATION** 

Page 32

	Market Value	Market Value	Percent	Percen
Company	Of Equity*	Of Debt*	Equity	Debt
Eagle Materials	4,814.79	933.97	84%	16%
Granite Construction	1,534.10	371.47	81%	19%
Martin Marietta Materials	20,987.94	4,947.90	81%	19%
Summit Materials	3,361.62	1,493.95	69%	31%
Vulcan Materials	23,272.12	4,426.00	84%	16%
Construction Partners	1,402.45	389.83	78%	22%

**Selected Equity and Debt Structure** 

80%

20%

GUIDELINE COMPANY INFORMATION SUMMARY					
	Return		Credit	Debt	
Company	On Equity	Beta	Rating	Rate	
Eagle Materials	17.00%	1.25	Baa2	5.59%	
Granite Construction	13.50%	1.20	N/A	N/A	
Martin Marietta Materials	9.50%	1.15	Baa2	5.59%	
Summit Materials	12.50%	1.55	Ba2	8.11%	
Vulcan Materials	14.50%	1.10	Baa2	5.59%	
Construction Partners	10.00%	0.95	N/A	N/A	
Selected for Indust	try 12.83%	1.20	Baa3	5.59%	



4/1/2023

2023

**SAND AND GRAVEL -- EQUITY MODELS** 

CAPM: RULE 62 COMPLI	ANT
Market Risk Premium	7.17%
X Industry Beta	1.20
Industry Risk Premium	8.60%
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%
Indicated Rate	12.74%

CAPM: IMPLIED ERP				
Market Risk Premium	4.96%			
X Industry Beta	1.20			
Industry Risk Premium	5.95%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	10.09%			

CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE				
Market Risk Premium	6.35%			
X Industry Beta	1.20			
Industry Risk Premium	7.62%			
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%			
Indicated Rate	11.76%			

MULTISTAGE DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL					
	Indicated Rates				
Company Name	Damodaran's	Damodaran's AP	Cornell's	Cornell's AP	
Eagle Materials	11.65%	9.56%	10.88%	13.71%	
Granite Construction	8.59%	10.89%	10.07%	11.64%	
Martin Marietta Materials	4.67%	6.42%	4.73%	6.44%	
Summit Materials	9.29%	8.79%	11.08%	13.18%	
Vulcan Materials	5.05%	6.47%	5.41%	7.09%	
Construction Partners	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Selected Rate	7.85%	8.43%	10.41%	8.43%	



2023

4/1/2023

**SAND AND GRAVEL -- DGM INPUTS** 

DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL INPUTS					
	Stock	Next Year's Next Year's		3-5 Year	Projected
Company Name	Price	Payout	EPS	EPS	Growth
Eagle Materials	132.85	6.66	11.25	11.90	8.50%
Granite Construction	35.07	1.31	2.95	4.40	10.51%
Martin Marietta Materials	337.97	2.64	14.05	14.70	4.50%
Summit Materials	28.39	0.87	1.65	2.35	15.50%
Vulcan Materials	175.11	1.70	6.25	7.75	8.50%
Construction Partners	26.69	N/A	0.65	1.30	11.50%



4/1/2023

2023

Page 35

### **URANIUM MINING -- EQUITY RATE SUMMARY**

	RECONCILIATION		
Equity Models		Weight	Equity Rate
CAPM: RULE 62		100%	10.59%
CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE		0%	9.86%
CAPM: IMPLIED ERP		0%	8.60%
DGM: DAMODARAN		0%	11.11%
DGM: DAMODARAN (AP)		0%	7.46%
DGM: CORNELL		0%	NMF
DGM: CORNELL (AP)		0%	NMF
Reconciled Equity Ra	te		10.59%
Reconciled Debt Rat	e		5.59%
Debt/Equity Structur	re		5% / 95%
WACC Conclusion			10.34%



4/1/2023

2023

### **URANIUM MINING -- COMPANY INFORMATION**

CALCULATION OF CAPITAL STRUCTURE						
Commoniu	Market Value I		Percent	Percent		
Company	Of Equity*	Of Debt*	Equity	Debt		
Cameco Corp	9,760.37	733.09	93%	7%		
	Selected Equity and Debt Str	ucture	95%	5%		

GUIDELI	GUIDELINE COMPANY INFORMATION SUMMARY						
		Return		Credit	Debt		
Company		On Equity	Beta	Rating	Rate		
Cameco Corp		10.00%	0.9	Baa3	5.59%		
Selected fo	or Industry	10.00%	0.90	Baa3	5.59%		

<sup>\*</sup>Amounts in Millions



4/1/2023

2023

Page 37

### **URANIUM MINING -- EQUITY MODELS**

CAPM: RULE 62 COMI	PLIANT	CAPM: IMPLIED ERP	
Market Risk Premium	7.17%	Market Risk Premium	4.96%
X Industry Beta	0.90	X Industry Beta	0.90
Industry Risk Premium	6.45%	Industry Risk Premium	4.46%
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%	Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%
Indicated Rate	10.59%	Indicated Rate	8.60%

CAPM: SUPPLY SIDE	Ē
Market Risk Premium	6.35%
X Industry Beta	0.90
Industry Risk Premium	5.72%
Add: Risk Free Rate	4.14%
Indicated Rate	9.86%

MULTISTAGE DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL						
	Indicated Rates					
Company Name	Damodaran's	Damodaran's AP	Cornell's	Cornell's AP		
Cameco Corp	11.11%	7.46%	N/A	N/A		
Selected Rate	11.11%	7.46%	NMF	NMF		



4/1/2023 **2023** 

Page 38

### **URANIUM MINING -- DGM INPUTS**

DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL INPUTS						
	Stock	Next Year's Next Year's		3-5 Year	Projected	
Company Name	Price	Payout	EPS	EPS	Growth	
Cameco Corp	22.57	0.12	0.80	1.50	N/A	